## University of Sussex Centre for Higher Education and Equity Research

## US University of Sussex



A Sociology of Absences: Interrogating Policies for Widening Participation in Higher Education in Ghana and Tanzania

Professor Louise Morley Professor Fiona Leach Dr Kattie Lussier Centre for Higher Education and Equity Research (CHEER), University of Sussex, UK.

Dr Linda Dzama Forde, University of Cape Coast, Ghana.

Dr Rosemarie Mwaipopo, University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.

www.sussex.ac.uk/education/wideningparticipation

http://www.sussex.ac.uk/education/chee

3 December, 2009



## **Researching Absences in Higher Education in Ghana and Tanzania**

#### **Professor Louise Morley**



## Why Research Higher Education in Africa?

## US University of Sussex



#### Major site of:

- ✓ cultural practice
- ✓ identity formation
- knowledge/wealth creation and dissemination
- ✓ symbolic control.

Student enrolment worldwide:

- ✓ 13 million in 1960
- ✓ 82 million in 1995
- ✓ 137.8 million in 2005
- 24% globally
- ✓ 5% in Sub-Saharan Africa
- Global Gender Parity Index of 1.05 (UNESCO, 2007).
- Global gender gap (World Economic Forum, 2008).
- UK = 13
- Ghana = 77
- Tz = 38

## **Conceptual, Contextual and Theoretical Challenges**





- 'Don't study the poor and powerless, because everything you say about them will be used against them' (Nader, 1972: 295).
- Representing the Other/ Orientalism (Said, 1995; Wilkinson and Kitzinger, 1996).
- De-parochialisation of research (Appadurai, 2004).
- Post-colonial power relations/ Higher education messaging systems of the North (Santos, 1995).
- Transnational feminisms (as opposed to masculinist discourses of transnational capitalism) (Mendoza, 2002).
- Hybridisation of public/private provision (Ball, 2008).
- Intersectionality, rather than fractured identities (Davis, 2008).
- Sociology of absences (Santos, 1999).
- Feminisation theory (Leathwood and Read, 3 December, 2009).

#### Widening Participation in Higher Education in Ghana and Tanzania: Developing Equity Scorecards

## US University of Sussex



#### Quantitative

**Equity Scorecards Measuring:** 

Sociological variables of gender, age, socio-economic status (SES)

In Relation to:

• Educational Outcomes: access, retention and achievement.

#### In Relation to:

- 4 Programmes of Study in each HEI.
- 2 Public and 2 private HEIs.
- Qualitative
- 200 life history interviews with students from public and private universities (100 Ghana and 100 Tanzania);
- 200 interviews with academic staff and policy makers in Ghana and Tanzania.

(Morley, Leach and Lugg, 2008; Morley and Lussier, 2009)

## **Qualititative Overview: Narrating Higher Education**

## US University of Sussex

#### Main Themes: Life History Interviews



#### Main Themes: Key Staff and Policy Makers Interviews



## Quantitative Overview: Absences and US Inclusions

#### • Women

- ✓ Majority on B.Sc. Admin Human Resources Management (Ghana, private);
- ✓ Minority on B.Sc. Agri-business Management (Ghana, private).
- Mature students
- Many on B.Primary Ed (Ghana, public), B.Ed with Maths (Tanzania, public)
- ✓ Absent on B.Sc Optometry (Ghana, Public), and in small numbers elsewhere.

#### Poor students

- ✓ More in Tanzanian universities e.g. Law, Education (public), Business (private):
- ✓ In Ghana some poor students on B. Primary Ed (public)
- Absent from B.Sc. Agri-business Management (Ghana, private), B.Sc. Optometry (Ghana, Public).
- Conclusion
- Studying Education is a route into HE for older and socially disadvantaged students.
- ✓ Women, poorer and older students less likely to enter STEM courses.
- Marginalised groups enter disciplines with lower exchange values in the labour market.

## Quantitative Overview: Getting In, Getting On



#### **Getting In: Ghana**

#### **Qualified to enter**

- 12.7% of students qualified to enter HE were selected;
- 6.62% of these were from deprived schools.

#### **Actually entering**

- 15.32% of the students from non-deprived schools that qualified to enter HE were selected;
- 3.72% of the students from deprived schools that qualified to enter HE were selected.

#### **Getting On: Ghana and Tanzania**

- Variability in completion rates relate more to programmes than to student identities;
- No significant difference between completion rates for men and women;
- The majority of students in both countries obtain 2<sup>nd</sup> class degrees;
- There is no significant difference between the achievement of marginalised and non-marginalised groups.



## Equity Scorecards: Measuring Access, Retention and Achievement in Ghana and Tanzania

**Dr Kattie Lussier** 



## Ghana: Access to Level 300, Public University 2007-8



		% of Students on the Programme													
Programme	Mar			Low SES		А	ge 30 or ov	er	Mature and Low SES						
	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women				
B. Sc. Optometry	81.82	18.18	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00				
B. Commerce	67.19	32.81	3.15	1.35	1.80	2.70	2.25	0.45	0.22	0.22	0.00				
B. Education (Primary)	56.13	43.87	7.74	7.10	0.65	58.71	36.77	21.94	5.16	5.16	0.00				
B. Mgt. Studies	58.96	41.04	1.49	0.75	0.75	3.36	0.75	2.61	0.00	0.00	0.00				

3 December, 2009

### **Ghana: Applications and Admissions, Private University, 2007/08**



	Numbe	er of Ap	plicants	~	Re	ason foi	r rejecti	on	% of Applicants Accepted			
Programme	Total	Men	Women	% Women Applicants	Wo	men	M	en	All	Women	Men	
					BC <sup>1</sup>	NMC <sup>2</sup>	BC	NMC				
B.Sc. Economics	391	267	124	31.71	52.73	47.27	49.58	50.42	11.51	11.29	11.61	
B.Sc. Human Resources Management	1575	567	1,008	64	46.53	53.47	52.27	47.73	14.41	14.29	14.64	
B.Sc. Agri-Business Management	102	81	21	20.59	50	50	52.94	47.06	13.73	4.76	16.05	
B.Sc. Accountancy	1050	620	430	40.95	35.47	64.53	33.72	66.28	15.25	12.79	16.96	

1. Below the cut off point for the programme

2. Not meeting criteria for admission to university

## Tanzania: Access, Level 100, 2007-8

## US University of Sussex

#### **Public University**

Programme	Women s	Students	Students fro	om Low SES	Mature Students		
Togramme	% Age 30 or over	% Low SES	% Women	% Age 30 or over	% Women	% Low SES	
B. Commerce	0.49	6.31	23.91	0.0	10.00	0.0	
LLB. Law	3.70	18.52	21.43	7.14	50.00	50.00	
B.Sc. Engineering	1.89	12.26	20.00	0.0	50.00	0.0	
<b>B. Science with Education</b>	0.0	15.38	13.33	11.11	0.0	27.78	

#### **Private University**

Programme	Women	Students	Students fro	om Low SES	Mature Students		
Trogramme	% Age 30 or over	% Low SES	% Women	% Age 30 or over	% Women	% Low SES	
<b>B. Business Administration</b>	14.81	25.93	25.00	0.0	30.77	0.0	
LLB. Law	8.45	2.82	25.00	25.00	37.50	12.50	
MD. Medicine	10.71	3.57	20.00	20.00	21.43	7.14	
B.Ed. Maths	35.71	3.57	4.00	48.00	8.85	10.62	

## Ghana: Retention, Level 400, 2007-08

#### University of Sussex

#### Withdrawal Public University

					% of all s	tudents on t	he programm	ne				
Programme	With	drawal	Wi	thdrawal Lov	v SES	Withdr	awal Age 30	or over	Withdrawal Mature & Low SES			
	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women	
B. Sc. Optometry	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
B. Commerce	12.67	7.82	0.00	0.00	0.00	9.70	7.55	2.16	0.00	0.00	0.00	
B. Ed. (Primary)	6.83	3.73	0.62	0.62	0.00	8.07	5.59	2.48	0.62	0.62	0.00	
B. Mgt Studies	4.97	10.87	0.31	0.31	0.00	6.52	2.80	3.73	0.31	0.31	0.00	

#### Withdrawal Private University

					% of all stu	idents on the	e programme	)			
Programme	With	drawal	Withdrawal Low SES			Withdra	awal Age 30	or over	Withdrawal Mature and Low SES		
	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women	Total	Men	Women
B.Sc. Economics	4.17	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
B.Sc. Human Resources Management	6.61	13.22	0.00	0.00	0.00	2.20	0.88	1.32	0.00	0.00	0.00
B.Sc. Agri-Business Management	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
B.Sc. Accountancy	3.73	2.48	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.62	0.62	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00

## Tanzania: Retention Level 100, 2007-08 US University of Sussex

#### Withdrawal Public University

	Wor	nen	Poor S	tudent	Matur	e Student
Programme	% on programme	% withdrawal	% on programme	% withdrawal	% on programme	% withdrawal
B. Commerce	33.23	1.46	8.39	0.0	1.61	0.0
LLB. Law	28.13	0.0	16.67	0.0	2.08	0.0
B.Sc. Engineering	26.04	0.94	10.57	5.71	0.98	25.00
B. Science with Education	16.18	15.38	19.50	17.78	7.47	44.44

#### Withdrawal Private University

	Wor	nen	Poor St	tudent	Mature Student		
Programme	% on programme % withdrawal		% on programme	% withdrawal	% on programme	% withdrawal	
B. Business Administration	43.55	7.41	19.35	12.50	20.97	0.0	
LLB. Law	41.04	1.41	8.09	0.0	9.25	7.69	
MD. Medicine	26.42	0.0	4.72	0.0	13.21	0.0	
B.Ed. Maths	13.02	0.0	11.63	0.0	52.56	0.0	

# **Ghana: Completion and Achievement, 2007-08**



#### **Completion Rate Public University**

	М	en	Wol	men	Poor St	tudents	Mature Students		
Programme	% on programme	% who completed							
B. Commerce	70.62	57.95	29.38	21.56	3.23	3.23	22.10	12.40	
B. Management Studies	5435	49.38	45.65	34.78	1.24	0.93	17.70	11.18	
B. Education (Primary)	56.52	49.69	43.48	39.75	10.56	9.94	72.67	64.60	
B. Sc. Optometry	75.00	75.00	25.00	25.00	0.00	-	0.00	-	

#### **Student Achievement Private University**

		Men			Women		Pa	or Studer	its	Mature Students		
Programme	% on progr.	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	% on Progr.	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	% on progr.	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	% on progr.	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class
<b>B.Sc. Economics</b>	83.33	0.00	80.00	16.67	0.00	75.00	4.17	0.00	100.0	0.00		
B.Sc. Human Resources Mgt.	29.52	0.00	67.16	70.48	0.00	68.12	0.88	0.00	100.0	4.41	0.00	50.0
B.Sc. Agri Business Mgt.	72.73	0.00	75.00	27.27	0.00	100.0	0.00			0.00		
B.Sc. Accountancy	57.76	0.00	83.87	42.24	0.00	86.76	0.62	0.00	100.0	3.11	0.00	80.0

## Tanzania: Achievement, 2007-08

## US University of Sussex

#### **Public University**

	V	Vomen		Poor	Student	S	Mature Students			
Programme	% on final Year programme	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	% on final year of programme	% 1 <sup>st</sup> cla ss	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	% on final year of programme	% 1 <sup>st</sup> clas s	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	
B. Commerce	29.64	0.63	93.04	6.94	0.0	88.57	2.06	0.0	81.82	
LLB. Law	41.10	0.0	69.07	9.75	0.0	84.21	5.08	0.0	66.67	
B.Sc. Engineering	25.60	4.17	85.42	12.80	5.00	82.50	4.27	0.0	81.25	
B. Science with Education	38.46	0.0	96.67	12.82	0.0	100	5.13	0.0	100	

#### **Private University**

		Women		Poor S	Students		Mature Students			
Programme	% on final year of programme	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	% on final year of programme	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	% on final year of programme	% 1 <sup>st</sup> class	% 2 <sup>nd</sup> class	
<b>B. Business</b> Administration	28.67	16.28	76.74	10.67	0.0	87.50	24.00	8.33	63.89	
LLB. Law	44.65	0.0	39.18	10.70	0.0	34.48	12.01	0.0	43.48	
B.Ed. Maths	29.82	0.0	100	12.28	0.0	100	77.19	0.0	100	

## Messages from the Equity Scorecards



- When structures of inequality are intersected, poor, older women disappear from majority of programmes.
- Equity Scorecards provide evidence that often contradicts national and organisational policy aspirations to widen participation.
- Variation across programmes and year groups needs closer monitoring.



### **Policy Activity, Contradictions and Aspirations**

#### **Professor Louise Morley**



### **Policy Context**



#### International

- UNESCO (1995): international solidarity in strengthening HE
- UNESCO (1998): WP as equity and social justice
- World Bank (WB) (2002): WP for poverty reduction
- WB & UNESCO Task Force on HE and Society (2000): WP as economic imperative
- Commission for Africa (2005): WP for building social institutions
- World Bank (2009): Tertiary Education and Growth in Sub-Saharan Africa

#### Ghana

- University Rationalisation Committee (1988): WP of 'non traditional' students
- White Paper on Reforms to Tertiary Education (1991): Spatial distribution of HE
- National Council of Tertiary Education (1993): WP of students with special needs
- National Council for Distance Education (1995)
- National Accreditation Board (1995): Private HE

#### Tanzania

- Tanzania Development Vision 2025 (1999): WP for development
- The National HE policy (1999): Expansion & private HE
- HE Policy on Disability (2004)
- HE Students Loans Board Act (2004)
- The Universities Act (2005): Equitable access



# Why Widen Participation in Higher Education?



- National Economic Development
- Social Development, Inclusion and Equity
- Labour Market Requirements
- Human Capital and Capacity Development



## Organisational Challenges to Widening Participation

## US University of Sussex

#### Staffing

- Capacity
- Workload
- Recruitment
- Succession Planning

#### Funding/ Demand Exceeding Supply

- Students' fees
- Unfunded expansion

#### **Lack of Quality Facilities**

- Classrooms
- Student accommodation
- Libraries
- Laboratories
- IT

So, limitations... one, critically is the capacity. (...) Conditions were very good in the universities at the time but the situation has changed. If you compare conditions with say conditions in the banks and other organisations, you find that the balances are tilting and therefore many people, first class people, who normally take the university as the first line of action do not come. Therefore you have a situation now that we call an 'ageing faculty'. Many people who have retired from the university continue to be there. One is the lack of teachers in medicine, in the critical areas... in engineering; you do not have the people to teach.

## **Perceptions of Staff and National Policymakers**

# University of Sussex



**Effective strategies** to widen

■ Pre-entry programmes

Evening/ Weekend programmes

□ Scholarships/ loans

■ Distance education

Outreach programmes

# Messages from Academics and Policymakers



#### **To Governments and Donors**

- Funding and quality HE are linked;
- Financing of HE to be reviewed *e.g.* student loans and scholarships/fee distribution;
- Quality enhancement of secondary education/ preparedness for HE;
- Policy initiatives for deprived regions.

#### **To HE Management**

- Ear-marked funding for WP students;
- Outreach activities in deprived areas;
- Improvement of support/ welfare/ retention services:
- Develop staff capacity/ professionalise HE;
- Invest in infrastructure e.g. estate, learning resources.



### **Student Voices in Ghana and Tanzania**

#### Dr Linda Dzama Forde



### **Overview of Themes**







## Narrating Higher Education Experiences: Support Growing Up

US University of Sussex

**Positive Support** 

#### **Counter - Support**

- Mothers at primary stage
- Fathers' aspirations
- ✓ Parents' social capital
- Siblings' prior educational experiences
- Teacher encouragement
- Peer group aspirations
- ✓Imagined futures

Poverty leading to school exclusion
 Gendered choices

- ✓ Teacher absenteeism
- ✓ Large classes/ overcrowding
- ✓ Domestic/ agricultural labour
- Violence (home and school)
- Bereavement, polygamy
- Long distances to travel to school

## Narrating Higher Education Experiences: Support for Entering HE

**Drivers** 

- Parental education and occupation
- Quality of schools/ teachers
- Proximity/ knowledge of universities
- Professional aspirations
- Desire to escape poverty/ wanting to 'become a somebody'

University of Sussex

Experience of HE in extended family

#### **Barriers**

- Lack of family social and material capital
- Gender
- Rural marginalisation
- Age: family and employment responsibilities
- Negative educational experiences
- Perception of HE as poor investment

## Narrating Higher Education Experiences: Support at University

Positive

- Loans Boards bursaries and scholarships
- Affirmative action programmes
- Part-time study
- Independent and Peer learning

#### Negative

 Poor quality lecturers/ lack of availability of lecturers/lack of professionalism

University of Sussex

- Transmission pedagogy
- Lack of resources e.g. IT, Library
- Large classes
- Sexual harassment
- Gender stereotyping
- Student unrest, boycotts, strikes
- Assessment: lack of transparency
- Favouritism

## Narrating Higher Education Experiences: Impact of HE

- Self confidence
- Social skills
- Broadening thinking
- Exposure to a different social group
- Subject knowledge
- Independence
- Social status
- Maturation
- Social networks
- Learning

"University I would say has affected me positively in so many ways (...) I can now stand in front of a whole crowd, talk to people even debate and if I can remember, it is something that I didn't know how to do. I was so shy of people but now I can say that I can now stand confidently in front of people, interact with people without even being afraid."

University of Sussex

### Narrating Higher Education Experiences: Gender, Poverty, Disability and Age







## **Summing Up**

#### **Professor Fiona Leach**



### Messages to Academic Managers, Policymakers and University Teachers



- Quality Assurance procedures and practices in higher education *e.g.* service-level agreements, codes of practice *i.e* for sexual harassment, transparency for assessment, professionalisation of university teachers;
- Widening Participation Policies: evaluation and monitoring;
- Robust management information systems, with more detailed indicators;
- Developing research capacity in African universities.

## Summing Up: Unequal Geographies of Knowledge





- Widening participation is often associated with quantitative change.
- Less emphasis on power relations, qualitative considerations of higher education experiences.
- Globally, enrolment in higher education is rising.
- Participation rates from a range of social groups are not increasing.
- In the globalised knowledge economy, wealth distribution, as well as wealth creation, needs to be considered.

## **Acknowledgements**





- ESRC and DFID for funding this 3-year project.
- Amandina Lihamba in Tanzania.
- Godwin Egbenya and Splendy Macauley in Ghana.

www.sussex.ac.uk/education/wideningparticipation

3 December, 2009

### **Project Outputs**



#### Publications

- Morley, L., and Lugg, R., (2008). "Democratising Higher Education in Ghana and Tanzania: Opportunity Structures and Social Processes." Journal of the World Universities Forum 1(6): 51-60.
- Morley, L., and Lugg, R., (2008). "Gender Equity in African Higher Education."\_*International Studies in Education* 9: 11-1
- Morley, L., Leach, F., and Lugg, R., (2009).
  "Democratising Higher Education in Ghana and Tanzania: Opportunity Structures and Social Inequalities." *International Journal of Educational Development* 29(1): 56-64.
- Morley, L., and Lugg, R., (2009). "Mapping Meritocracy: Intersecting Gender, Poverty and Higher Educational Opportunity Structures." *Higher Education Policy* 22(1): 37-60.
- Morley, L., and Lussier, K., (2009). "Intersecting Poverty and Participation in Higher Education in Ghana and Tanzania." In press, *International Studies in Sociology of Education, 19(2).*

- <u>Working papers</u>
  (http://www.sussex.ac.uk/education/1-4-30 <u>7.html</u>)
- Working Paper 1 (2007) Setting the Scene (Morley, Leach, Lugg, Lihamba, Opare, Bhalalusesa, Forde, Egbenya, Mwaipopo)
- Working Paper 2 (2007) Country Profiles for Ghana and Tanzania:Economic, social and political contexts for widening participation in higher education (Lugg, Morley, Leach)
- Working Paper 3 (2007) A Profile of Participation in Higher Education in Ghana and Tanzania (Lugg,
- Morley, Leach)
- Working Paper 4 (2008) 'Policies for Widening Participation in Higher Education' (Leach, Morley, Lugg, Lihamba, Opare, Bhalalusesa, Forde, Egbenya, Mwaipopo)